

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf



Curtis Sinclair
Lead Author

Sam Westrop & Julie Lenarz
Contributing Authors

www.hscentre.org
www.ashcam.org

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|----|
| Contents..... | i |
| Foreword..... | 1 |
| Glossary..... | 3 |
| Executive Summary..... | 4 |
| Authors and Organisations..... | 4 |
| Aims and Methodology | 4 |
| Interviews with PMOI Members Present at Camp Liberty | 5 |
| Conclusions..... | 5 |
| Recommendations | 6 |
| Introduction | 7 |
| The Massacre | 9 |
| Timeline of Events | 9 |
| Evidence of the Highly Organised Nature of the Attack | 14 |
| Evidence that the Attackers were Iraqi Soldiers | 14 |
| The Transfer to Camp Liberty..... | 15 |
| Conclusions..... | 15 |
| Involvement of the Iraqi Government | 17 |
| Daily Reports of Hossein Madani | 17 |
| Attempted Cover-up by the Iraqi Government..... | 18 |
| The Committee for the Liquidation of Camp Ashraf (CLCA) | 20 |
| Direct Abuse by Committee Members | 21 |
| Links to the Iranian Regime | 22 |
| The Seven Missing Residents | 23 |
| Capture of The Seven | 23 |
| Statements on the 7 Camp Ashraf hostages | 24 |
| Conclusions..... | 24 |
| Conclusions and Recommendations | 25 |

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

| | |
|---|----|
| Recommendations | 27 |
| Appendix A: List of Statements on the Massacre | 28 |
| Appendix A.1: Statements by UN Officials | 28 |
| Appendix A.2: Statements by US Officials..... | 31 |
| Appendix A.3: Statements by British Officials..... | 33 |
| Appendix A.4: Statements by Other Organisations | 34 |
| Appendix B: Membership of the Committee for the Liquidation of Camp Ashraf (CLCA) | 37 |
| <i>Nouri al-Maliki</i> | 37 |
| <i>Faleh al-Fayad</i> | 37 |
| <i>Mowaffak al-Rubaie</i> | 38 |
| <i>Ali al-Yeseri</i> | 39 |
| <i>Haqqi Karim</i> | 40 |
| <i>Sadique Mohammad Khazem</i> | 40 |
| <i>Nezar, Mashi and Khozeir</i> | 40 |
| Endnotes | 41 |

FOREWORD

1 September 2014

There are few predictions one can accurately make about the Middle East. Today's certainties become tomorrow's chaos. Alliances turn into feuds, cities into rubble, and peoples into dust. Often, it seems the only assurance we do have is the inevitability of further bloodshed.

The pledged extermination of a minority group appears, sadly, not to be an aberration in the Middle East, but the norm. In Iraq, the Yazidis and Turkmen's flight from slaughter at the hands of Sunni Islamist groups has, for once, captured the world's attention. Western powers have embarked on military and humanitarian missions to save the beleaguered refugees.

To the east, however, another group is imprisoned within Camp Liberty. Dissidents from the Iranian regime, the Camp's inmates are survivors of their former home, Camp Ashraf. Over the past decade, Iraqi troops, with Iranian complicity, laid siege to Camp Ashraf and periodically purged it of its inhabitants. This brutal campaign culminated in a particularly bloody massacre on 1 September 2013, in which armed Iraqi gunmen murdered 52 of Camp Ashraf's residents and kidnapped 7 others.

There have been no airlifts for the men, women and children from Camp Ashraf. The West has not offered humanitarian aid or military support. Those responsible have escaped censure.

In this vital report, the Ashraf Campaign and the Human Security Centre have traced the timeline of the suffering endured by Camp Ashraf's inhabitants, identified those responsible for these crimes, and produced much-needed analysis and context.

The publication of this report will provide an important resource for those voices around the world advocating on behalf of Camp Ashraf's survivors, and, hopefully, it will help galvanise lawmakers and officials within international bodies to re-examine the increasing influence of the Iranian regime and pay greater attention to the Iraqi Government's agenda.

None would claim the West has steered clear of the Middle East at any point in the recent past. But Western attention often appears unable to focus on more than one horror in the region at any one time. This parochial approach has often led to unsavoury alliances, most often brought about by short-sighted claims of necessity.

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

The most recent example of this can be found in Western powers' response to threat of the Islamic State, which is busy slaughtering its way across Syria and Iraq. Both Iranian and American militaries are presently working in concert to counter the threat posed by Sunni terrorists. A few British military figures, meanwhile, have even advocated a Western alliance with the Iranian-backed Assad regime in Syria to curb the Islamic State's expansion.

The indisputable horrors of the Islamic State must be opposed, but to embrace Iranian-led regimes as tacit allies in this fight, as its proxies slaughter innocents from Aleppo to Camp Liberty, is as immoral as it is ultimately ruinous.

The region's tangled web of actors, forever recasting themselves into complex alliances and ancient hatreds, usually affords little clarity and provides few easy answers. There is nothing too complicated, however, about the concerted slaughter of Camp Ashraf's residents. Policy-makers across the world would do well to study this report and heed the advice and recommendations its authors have made.

Sam Westrop

Distinguished Senior Fellow, Gatestone Institute

www.gatestoneinstitute.org

GLOSSARY

CLCA: Committee for the Liquidation of Camp Ashraf (aka Ashraf Suppression Committee)

GOI: Government of Iraq

PMOI/MEK: People's Mojahedin Organisation of Iran / Mujahedin-e Khalq

MOIS: (Iranian) Ministry of Information and Security

NCRI: National Council of Resistance of Iran

IRGC: (Iranian) Islamic Revolutionary Guard Corps

IRGC-QF: (Iranian) Islamic Revolutionary Guard Corps – Qods Force

UNAMI: United Nations Assistance Mission in Iraq

UNHRC: United Nations Human Rights Council

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

AUTHORS AND ORGANISATIONS

This report is a collaborative effort on the part of the Human Security Centre and the Ashraf Campaign.

The Human Security Centre (HSC) is an independent foreign policy think tank that seeks to draw attention to the consequences of action and inaction in the face of serious human rights abuses and violence against civilians around the world. To further this goal, the HSC produces high-quality commentary, analysis and scholarly research on humanitarian intervention, international security policy and democracy promotion. The HSC publishes its own commentary and papers on a wide range of topics on its website and in international media outlets, ranging from the *Guardian* to the *Spectator*, and have appeared on the BBC and Sky News. Julie Lenarz (Contributing Author) serves as the Executive Director of the HSC.

The Ashraf Campaign (ASHCAM) was launched in February 2013 by students at the University of York following a deadly mortar attack on Camp Liberty that killed eight detainees. ASHCAM campaigns for the international recognition of Camp Liberty as a refugee camp, and the evacuation of the detainees to countries where they will be safe. Curtis Sinclair (Lead Author) serves as Co-Chairman of ASHCAM.

Sam Westrop (Contributing Author) is a Distinguished Senior Fellow of the Gatestone Institute, a New York-based think tank chaired by John R. Bolton, former US Ambassador to the UN. He also serves as the Director of Stand for Peace, a London-based joint Jewish-Muslim interfaith counter-extremism research group.

AIMS AND METHODOLOGY

The aims of this report are:

1. To establish a detailed chronology of events in Camp Ashraf on 1 September 2013.
2. To identify the perpetrators of the attack.
3. To place the massacre within a wider context, making recommendations for Western policymakers regarding future action.

This report has been written using all of the reliable evidence that the authors have been able to gather within the time period set for its production. It has been deemed

necessary by the Human Security Centre and the Ashraf Campaign to balance this requirement with the need for accurate and timely analysis of the massacre, due to the rapidly changing situation in Iraq. It should be noted by the reader that, during the production of this report, another deadly mortar attack targeting Camp Liberty killed four detainees, and there have also been unconfirmed reports about the death of one of the seven missing Camp Ashraf residents. In such a fast-evolving political and security environment, the authors recognise the impossibility of collating and analysing all available evidence, but they are confident that the evidence used in this report is accurate, and that their conclusions are strongly supported by fact.

INTERVIEWS WITH PMOI MEMBERS PRESENT AT CAMP LIBERTY

In order to understand as fully as possible the events that transpired at Camp Ashraf on 1 September 2013, the Lead Author has conducted interviews and received written testimony from all 42 surviving residents of Camp Ashraf, who were present on that day and are now incarcerated at Camp Liberty. These interviews were conducted over various forms of electronic media between 1 January 2014 and 1 May 2014.

The Lead Author has made every effort – including cross-referencing individual testimonies, video evidence, contemporary news reports, and pre-existing literature on the September 1st massacre – to ensure that all testimonies given are as reliable as possible, and is content with the veracity of the testimonies given.

CONCLUSIONS

All reliable evidence has conclusively pointed to the culpability of the Iraqi Government – particularly the Iraqi Prime Ministry, (outgoing) Prime Minister Nouri al-Maliki, the Committee for the Liquidation of Camp Ashraf, and elements of the Iraqi security forces – in the execution of the massacre at Camp Ashraf.

This conclusion has been reached not only on the basis of the testimonies given by the 42 interviewed survivors, who together recount a coherent narrative of an efficient and deadly attack by Iraqi forces, but also various forms of reliable independent media, which similarly assert that the responsibility of the massacre lies with the Iraqi Government.

Although an analysis of the information pertaining to Camp Ashraf on 1 September 2013 clearly points to the Iraqi Government as the guilty party, a greater understanding of Prime Minister Nouri al-Maliki's administration's motives can be gleaned from an analysis of the Government's actions, both before and after 1 September 2013. By analysing the September 1st massacre within the context of the Maliki administration's relationship with the PMOI in Iraq, the authors of this report understand the massacre to be but one blow in a protracted campaign of oppression against the group by the Iraqi Government, acting at the behest of the Iranian regime.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Having each independently concluded that the September 1st massacre at Camp Ashraf was the result of pre-planned action by Maliki's administration – with guidance and encouragement from the Iranian regime – the authors of this report recommend:

1. That the UN and US recognise their failings with regard to the protection of PMOI members in Iraq since the 2003 invasion of the country.
2. That the UN launches an official investigation into the conduct of UNAMI and its former chief, Martin Kobler, and publishes its findings.
3. That Western governments immediately offer asylum to the PMOI members currently incarcerated by the Iraqi Government at Camp Liberty, and that the UN expedites this process with the full provision of resources appropriate to the task.
4. That the UN, EU, Western governments and independent NGOs conduct their own analyses of the events that transpired on 1 September 2013 at Camp Ashraf, as well as of conditions in which PMOI members currently reside in Iraq, and act accordingly to ameliorate these conditions.
5. That the UN and Western governments take action to ensure the security of those at Camp Liberty, including the use of economic sanctions and other appropriate measures against the Iranian regime – from where the oppression of the PMOI in Iraq stems – and deploy peacekeepers at Camp Liberty until asylum is found for them outside Iraq.

INTRODUCTION

The People's Mojahedin Organisation of Iran, or PMOI, is an Iranian opposition movement that has existed since 1965 and, due to the current Iranian regime's systematic persecution of its members from 1981 onwards, has had a significant presence in neighbouring Iraq since 1986.

Despite its good relationship with the majority of Iraqi people, the PMOI has come under increasing pressure from the Iraqi Government that succeeded Saddam Hussein's regime in 2003, due to the Iranian regime's overbearing influence on the new political leadership in Baghdad.

Where once PMOI members in Iraq numbered in the tens of thousands, today there are only around 2,800, all of whom are confined by the Iraqi Government to Camp Liberty, a derelict former US military base described by the UN Human Rights Council as akin to a "detention centre," and by the former Head of the UN's Human Rights Office in Iraq as resembling a "concentration camp."¹

Since the 2003 liberation of Iraq, the PMOI members in Camps Liberty and Ashraf have suffered physical and psychological abuse at the hands of both the Iraqi Government and militia groups armed and funded by the Iranian regime.

On 28 July 2009, soon after US forces handed control of Camp Ashraf over to their Iraqi counterparts, Iraqi security forces stormed the camp, using "tear gas, water cannon and batons against camp residents ... beating people ... [and] deliberately driving military vehicles into crowds," according to Amnesty International.² The attack left 11 residents dead, and nearly 500 wounded.³ In addition, 36 were abducted and detained until 7 October 2009.⁴

The second attack on Camp Ashraf, which left 36 dead, came on 8 April 2011.⁵ As before, "Iraqi troops moved into the camp ... and used excessive force against residents ... using armoured personnel carriers and, apparently, live fire," Amnesty International reported, also noting that "video clips of the clashes ... appear to show Iraqi soldiers firing indiscriminately into the crowds and using vehicles to try and run others down."⁶

Following the forcible relocation of most Camp Ashraf residents to Camp Liberty in 2012, three major attacks have been perpetrated against the new facility. Mortar fire on 9 February 2013,⁷ 15 June 2013⁸ and 26 December 2013⁹ killed a total of 14

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

residents. All three attacks were claimed by the Mukhtar Army,¹⁰ an Iranian-backed militia group known to be affiliated with Iraqi Prime Minister Nouri al-Maliki.¹¹

This report examines the most recent, and the most deadly, attack on Camp Ashraf. On 1 September 2013, armed men entered the camp and systematically killed 52 residents – more than half of the remaining population – and abducted seven others, who have not been seen or heard from since that time.

The surviving 42 residents, who along with their murdered and kidnapped colleagues had been permitted to remain at Camp Ashraf to negotiate the sale of property belonging to the former Camp Ashraf residents now incarcerated at Camp Liberty, were transported to Camp Liberty on 11 September 2013.

In the interests of justice, this report seeks to identify the perpetrators of that massacre, in the hope that they will one day soon be held accountable by the international community for their crimes against humanity. It is also hoped that the findings contained in this report will motivate Western governments, NGOs and international bodies to take swift and effective action against these perpetrators, and to the benefit of the survivors and their colleagues at Camp Liberty.

THE MASSACRE

TIMELINE OF EVENTS

31st Aug ~11.30pm A convoy of vehicles approaches Camp Ashraf from the north and parks outside the Rapid Deployment Force (RDF) headquarters, where 150 police are stationed. Residents recognise at least one of the vehicles as belonging to General Jamil al-Shameri, police commander of the Diyala Province.¹²

Two more vehicles arrive from an outpost of the 36th Brigade, a unit of the Iraqi Army stationed less than 700 meters away from Lions Gate.

Following discussions with a police guard, the residents are told that General Shameri was meeting with Colonel Nahad, Commander of the RDF, but that it was not a “serious matter.”¹³

| | | |
|----------------------|----------|---|
| 1 st Sept | ~12.30am | General Jamil and his convoy leave the vicinity of Camp Ashraf. |
|----------------------|----------|---|

| | | |
|--|---------|---|
| | ~5.00am | Lions Gate: In fear of the suspicious movements of Iraqi forces, four residents decide to keep watch at Lions Gate. Colonel Nahad drives up to the gate, looks around and then approaches and converses with the soldiers stationed at the Iraqi guard post north of the gate. He then gets back into his car and is driven up and down the northwest side of the camp, before returning to Lions Gate. |
|--|---------|---|

A group of five or six armed men are seen approaching along an embankment that runs parallel to the western boundary of the camp, cutting through the barbed wire surrounding the camp fence and climbing down the embankment. Colonel Nahad is reported to be watching this process, and the residents report overhearing the intruders speaking in Arabic with an Iraqi accent.¹⁴

The attackers open fire on the four residents keeping watch, who manage to escape unharmed. The attackers then go on to ransack residents’ trailers, stealing many items of value.

100th Street, across from the Mosque:

Resident Sayed Ali Bagherzadeh, who was situated near the mosque, sees another group of armed men crossing the embankment onto 100th Street, but manages to escape and reach the residential quarters to warn other residents.

Residents Amir Afzali and Amir Masoud Nazari drive up to the post to investigate. Upon arrival, both are assumed to have been pulled from their minibus and shot in the head on the street. It is also suspected that Afzali was strangled. The Iraqi forces later use this minibus as an escape vehicle to abscond with some of the hostages.

From vantage points around the mosque, other residents see as many as 40 armed men cross through Flower Square into Area 49.

Some residents telephone Fatemeh Tahoori, the resident answering calls in the Camp Control Room, to warn of the attack.

Tulip Square:

A third group of attackers are seen entering the camp through Tulip Square, where the only entrance to the camp is located. This entrance is usually blocked by an RDF police truck and barbed wire.

Vehicles depart from the nearby Moein Complex, where an Iraqi military intelligence unit is located, and approach Tulip Square from the north, dropping off five armed men. Two soldiers from the RDF move the RDF truck and the barbed wire, allowing the vehicles to enter.¹⁵

The residents in Tulip Square hear gunshots and begin fleeing the area. Bijan Mirzaee is shot as he leaves his post. He survives, but is later found by the attackers and killed with a gunshot to the head at point-blank range, in full view of the Iraqi police watchmen.¹⁶

**~5.15-
7.00am**

After entering through Tulip Square, the embankment at 100th Street and Lions Gate, the attackers work their way into Areas 49, 51 and 52, where most of the residents are located. Gunshots are fired by on group of attackers, in Area 49, as another advances forward, close to where many of the residents were initially situated. Some of the residents who were in the vicinity of Tulip Square are able to inform other residents in Area 49 of the oncoming attackers,

enabling them to escape towards Area 51.¹⁷

Resident Naser Kermanian is pulled from his bicycle and shot in the head. Two other residents, Mohammad Reza Safavi and Aliasghar Emadi, are then shot dead while attempting to close the northern gate into Area 52. The attackers move further into Area 52, pursuing a group of residents as they escort their wounded into the camp's medical clinic.

On reaching the clinic, a group of attackers shoot Abbas Garmabi, Irag Ahmadi, Hamid Jafary, Shahram Yaseri, Koorosh Saeedi, Ali Hosseini, and the camp's acting medic, Saied Norasi.

In the dormitories adjacent to the medical clinic, Abdolghasem Rezvani and Hossein Isfahani are shot.

A group of attackers moves into an area with a cluster of buildings, where residents are hiding, in Area 51. One of the residents is killed by an attacker, with a gunshot to the head, in front of the west gate of Area 51.¹⁸ Outside of the buildings, in the garden, Hassan Soltani, Hossein Malaki, Mohammad Jafarzadeh and Hamid Sabery are killed.

Hossein Madani and Rahim Tabari, two legal representatives of the residents at Camp Ashraf, are seen in Area 51 making telephone calls to officials at UNAMI and the US Embassy.¹⁹

In the courtyard of one of the buildings, Yasser Hajian, Alireza Pour Mohammad, Behrooz Fathollah Nejad, Arbab Mahdavi and Shahrokh Ohadi are killed. The attackers enter this building, killing Fariborz Sheikholeslami, Rahim Tabari, Khorow Gilani, Nasser Sarabi and Ali Golkar after breaking down a locked door. Tabari had attempted to call the local Iraqi police, but was unable to get a response. In this building, Hossein Madani is shot in the stomach and flees to the next building to call the UNAMI advisor Mohammed al-Najjar. He is pursued, and shot, alongside Saeed Saeidy, Mohammad Gorgie, Ardeshir Sharifian, and Alireza Khoshnevis.

As the attackers make their way to the South Building in Area 51, they arrest Hossein Rasoly, Rahman Mannani, Saaid Akhavan Hashemi, Ebrahim Asadi and Maryam Hosseiny poor. In the South Building, Giti Giveh, Mahboobeh Sabzi, Fatemeh Kamyab, Hasan Jabbari, Ramin Mecanik, Ali

Mahmoodi, Alireza Khoshnevis and Nasser Habashi are killed. Ali Mahmoodi had earlier been shot in the vicinity of the South Building, before being carried inside by a number of the other residents and shot again – this time in the head – by the attackers, presumably while still unconscious.²⁰ In the office of Zohre Ghaemy in the South Building, Esmail Rajabi finds Ghaemy's body and that of Zhila Tolou, Ali Mahmoodi and Ali Asghar Mekanik. All had been shot in the head, with Rajabi noting that Ghaemy had been "shot in the face so many times that I couldn't recognize her at first glance."²¹

The five who were earlier arrested outside of the South Building are summarily executed, alongside Maryam Hosseinypour.²² Hojjat Gholampour is shot dead as the attackers leave the building. All are killed with a single bullet to the head, some with their hands tied behind their back.²³

In another building in Area 51, Esmail Rajabi finds in the office of Giti Giveh the bodies of Giveh, Mahboobeh Sabzi and Fatemeh Kamyeh. He noted in interview that "Ms. Giveh was still holding her cell phone in her hand. Ms. Kamyeh had been shot in the head while she was sitting. It was evident that she had been injured before she was killed."²⁴

**~6.00-
7.00am**

A group of residents reaches the Control Room and telephone Camp Liberty for help. A resident at Camp Liberty then telephones UNAMI, and speaks to Mohammed al-Najjar (the political advisor to the acting Special Representative of the UN Secretary-General in Iraq, Gyorgy Busztin.) It has been posited that Iraqi authorities, including General Shameri, reported to Najjar that nothing was happening at Camp Ashraf.

Soon afterward, another resident at Camp Liberty emails Francesco Motta, the Director of UNAMI's Human Right Office.

Motta swiftly replies to the email, stating that UNAMI had "called Iraqi military who have denied [sic] that anything is happening. General al-Shameri says they are on standby to receive any wounded should it be the case that anything has taken place."²⁵

~7.00am

A resident at Camp Liberty directly contacts the UNAMI representative for Diyala Province, Amer Wghad al-Qeisi. Qeisi informs the residents at Camp Liberty that he cannot act without a directive from UNAMI's headquarters in

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

| | | |
|----------------------------|---------------------|--|
| | | Baghdad, which he had not received. ²⁶ |
| | ~7.00-9.00am | The attackers gather in the parking area of Area 51 with seven hostages: Mahnaz Azizi, Vajihe Karbalaey, Zahra Ramezany, Lila Nabahat, Fatemeh Tahoori, Fatehma Sakhie and Mohammad Ratebi. They are placed into a truck, while the remaining attackers steal a minibus belonging to the residents. From Area 51, both vehicles travel to Tulip Square, where three of the hostages are transferred to the minibus. |
| | | The attackers leave the camp through the gate in Tulip Square. |
| | ~9.00am | A resident at Camp Liberty again calls Qeisi, who repeats that he cannot act without the express permission of his superiors. Qeisi confirms that UNAMI is aware of the reports of an attack. At this point – according to what Qeisi said to the remaining residents when he eventually did arrive at Camp Ashraf – he attempts to make arrangements with the Iraqi police, but is hindered by their refusal to accompany him into Camp Ashraf. |
| | ~11.00am | Qeisi receives authorisation from UNAMI to travel to Camp Ashraf. |
| | ~2.00pm | Qeisi enters Camp Ashraf. His journey is delayed by issues with transportation, as well as problems with getting the authorisation to enter from the Iraqi police. When the police refuse to accompany him, he enters the camp on foot. |
| | | Residents begin to come out from hiding after receiving telephone calls from residents at Camp Liberty confirming that the attackers have left. Qeisi takes pictures and videos of all of the victims. ²⁷ |
| | | The truck and stolen minibus used to transport the seven hostages are at this point viewable outside the headquarters of the 19 th Brigade of the Iraqi Army. |
| 2nd Sept | | Francesco Motta arrives at Camp Ashraf, where residents point out the vehicles outside the headquarters of the 19 th Brigade. Motta meets with General Shameri and asks him to return the vehicles. Shameri rejects the request, reportedly stating that the property “no longer” belonged to the residents. ²⁸ |
| 9th Sept | ~5.00pm | The residents gather in preparation for their transfer to Camp Liberty. Mahmoud Valipour, who was filming the transfer, recalled in interview that he was attacked by “Iraqi SWAT and RDF units along with Colonel Nahad ... Around 8 of them attacked me and punched, kicked and hit me with clubs, injuring me in the head and face, and tore up my |

clothing.” Only with the intervention of other residents was he able to flee.²⁹

A note on sources: *This timeline has been produced using a large variety of sources, which are referenced in the endnotes of this report, including interviews with survivors, images, videos and other documentary evidence. The report produced by Perseus Strategies in the aftermath of the attack has not been referenced explicitly at each point in which it is drawn upon, but has been drawn upon throughout.*³⁰

EVIDENCE OF THE HIGHLY ORGANISED NATURE OF THE ATTACK

It is clear from the timeline of events that the attack against the residents of Camp Ashraf was a highly-organised, premeditated operation. The attackers acted in concert, with resident Abdul Hossein Solaymani noting that, “although the assailants entered the camp through different locations, they did so in unison, ... [thereby] proving that they had a specific organisation. The beginning of the raid was marked by a single shot, which was answered by another shot, [which] shows that the attackers were coordinating their moves and had a set of codes to communicate.”³¹ This has been corroborated by other survivors.³² The three groups of attackers quickly and efficiently made their way through the camp to the living quarters of the residents, displaying a clear understanding of the layout of Camp Ashraf. As has been noted by eyewitnesses, the attackers made use of tactics such as temporary detention of residents, including the arrest of residents outside of the South Building in Area 51, to maximise the efficiency of the killing.

EVIDENCE THAT THE ATTACKERS WERE IRAQI SOLDIERS

As has been corroborated by various eyewitness accounts, the attack was overseen by Iraqi Army officers such as Colonel Nahad, who was watching the attackers enter Camp Ashraf at Lions Gate. The purpose of General Shameri’s visit to Lions Gate, merely hours before the start of the attack, was most likely to brief Iraqi forces at Camp Ashraf on the eve of action against the residents. Although this cannot be proven, the proximity of the General’s visit to the attack lends weight to this view.

Resident Alireza Akbari noted that the attackers were “attired in military uniform, black trousers and vests, white caps and olive-green shirts. They were armed with AK-47s and pistols, and their faces were covered. It was clear that they were wearing special forces’ uniform, and their outfit was exactly the same as that used by the Interior Ministry’s Special Forces and the Prime Ministry’s Special Operations Taskforce.” Furthermore, those residents stationed at Lions Gate, who were within earshot of the attackers entering at that point, have noted that the attackers spoke Arabic with an Iraqi accent.

Most damning are the movements of the attackers after the attack, particularly those leaving, with the seven hostages, via Tulip Square to the headquarters of the 19th Brigade. These vehicles, including a minibus stolen from the residents during the

attack, could be seen for several days after 1 September 2013, both by residents and UN officials Qeisi and Motta. Considering that the attackers were seen to have taken the minibus, that Shameri admitted that Iraqi forces had taken the minibus, and that the minibus was actually taken to an Iraqi Army facility, it is beyond doubt that the taking of hostages was conducted with at least the partial assistance of the Iraqi authorities under the control of the Prime Ministry.

THE TRANSFER TO CAMP LIBERTY

Ten days after the massacre, on 11 September 2013, the remaining 42 Camp Ashraf residents, and some of their movable property, were transported by UN armoured buses to Camp Liberty.

Despite assurances given to the residents by UNAMI officials that no party involved in the relocation would disclose the news of the transfer, General Shameri tipped off several journalists in the afternoon of 11 September.³³ Upon arrival at Camp Ashraf, these journalists – all employees of various newspapers and television networks aligned with Maliki's administration and the Iranian regime – proceeded to harass the residents as they boarded the UN buses. One of the 42 residents, Mahmoud Valipour, recalled that, "when we were leaving Camp Ashraf at the gate, General Shameri was being interviewed by reporters."³⁴ Video evidence confirms this.

It is possible that General Shameri also notified certain Iranian-backed militiamen – or else his favourable contacts in the media did – because, en route to Camp Liberty, the residents' convoy was targeted by two explosions outside Khalis. "Fortunately," recalled Mahmoud Valipour, "the bus that the residents were on was not hit, but the vehicles carrying the loads [of property] were hit."³⁵ In his testimony, Alireza Akbari explained that the residents only escaped unharmed because, "a few moments earlier, the bus had come across a dog on the road and had to slow down, and so the bomb's timing was disrupted and it exploded in front of the bus, and not exactly at the time of its passing."³⁶

CONCLUSIONS

It is clear that the Iraqi authorities already stationed at Camp Ashraf were fully involved in the execution of the attack. As has been noted by eyewitness accounts and other evidence, the forces charged with guarding the camp stood aside and allowed the massacre to take place. The killing of Bijan Mirazaei in Tulip Square, in full view of the Iraqi police, is a prime example of what is at the very least wilful negligence, or more likely shared culpability for the attacks, of those who should have been protecting Camp Ashraf and its residents. Iraqi authorities at the camp – who were obviously aware of the attack that was going on around them – and their superiors outside the camp, such as General Shameri, lied to UNAMI during its execution, as is

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

evidenced by the correspondence between residents of Camps Liberty and Ashraf and UNAMI officials such as Qeisi.

Together, these factors – even without considering the Maliki administration's history of oppression of the PMOI in Iraq, or the actions of the Iraqi Government in the aftermath of the attack – paint a clear picture of an assault by government forces organised by its highest levels, making use of General Shameri as an information conduit on the ground, and Iraqi military officers such as Colonel Nahad to monitor the progress of the attacking forces. It seems clear that the role of the Iraqi police and army units already stationed at Camp Ashraf was to stand aside during the attack, and to obstruct the flow of information from within the camp. Most damning, however, is the resemblance of those attacking the camp, in both their appearance and methods, to highly-trained government operatives.

INVOLVEMENT OF THE IRAQI GOVERNMENT

DAILY REPORTS OF HOSSEIN MADANI

Hossein Madani, who was stationed at Camp Ashraf as the residents' legal advisor, and is described by the NCRI as a "veteran member of the Iranian Resistance's Foreign Affairs Commission," kept a full daily account of occurrences at Camp Ashraf. His account demonstrates persistent efforts by members of the CLCA to intimidate, harass, demoralise, physically abuse and, ultimately, to herd residents within the camp so as to make them an easier target in an attack.

Figure 1: Excerpts of Daily Reports by Hossein Madani

Ashraf Daily Report - 10 Aug 2013: "Since this morning, the electricity of [Camp] Ashraf has been cut off in order to put pressure on the guardians of [our] property. The act came with the direct order of Major Ahmad, who is linked to the Prime Ministry, with the aim of harassing the residents ... It is noteworthy that the entry of fuel is prohibited in [Camp] Ashraf by the GOI, and using generators is not an option in the 43°C heat ... The guardians of [our] property have asked UNAMI to warn the GOI, and to stop this suppressive act."

Ashraf Daily Report - 12 Aug 2013: The Iraqi government has implemented new anti-humane restrictions, to put pressure on the guardians of [our] property in [Camp] Ashraf, by cutting electricity for long hours and cutting the water pumping in near-50°C heat, which is still ongoing to this hour and, if continued, will cause serious problems for the residents. The measure conducted by Major Ahmad (the officer linked to the Iraqi Prime Ministry) is a new repressive act, to exert pressure on the residents at the behest of the Iranian regime.

Ashraf Daily Report (No.1) - 18 Aug 2013: Nine days after the start of electricity cuts in [Camp] Ashraf, carried out for political purposes and by instructions of [the] Iranian regime's agents in the Iraqi Prime Ministry, the crises has exacerbated. The 100 residents of Ashraf are facing serious problems, due to not having power and fuel in the 50°C summer heat.

Ashraf Daily Report (No.2) - 18 Aug 2013: Since yesterday, no water has been pumped into [Camp] Ashraf. The residents, after numerous contacts with the relevant water authorities, found out that Major Ahmad has prohibited the water station employees from pumping any water into [Camp] Ashraf, and has threatened to punish any disobedience.

The water cut [enforced] on [Camp] Ashraf, after cutting the electricity and banning [the] entry of food, which was done by the Iraqi forces today, are pieces of an overall anti-humane plan to exert pressure on the remaining residents in [Camp] Ashraf.

[It is] noteworthy that these inhumane pressures started on 10 Aug, and Lt. Mashri (an officer linked to the Prime Ministry, wanted internationally for massacre[s] of the residents) has come to stay in [Camp] Ashraf for the same purpose.

Ashraf Daily Report - 19 Aug 2013: The GOI has totally prohibited electricity, water, food and medicine [from entering Camp] Ashraf, using them as a weapon against the residents. In recent days, the guardians of [our] property [have] had no cooling device in the 50°C heat. The GOI yesterday prevented the entry of a food and medicine cargo, which was the monthly consumption of the residents, while the remaining food in [Camp] Ashraf is due to [rot] because of lack of electricity. The last food load that came to [Camp] Ashraf was on 10 July 2013, i.e. 40 days ago.

ATTEMPTED COVER-UP BY THE IRAQI GOVERNMENT

Officials of the Iraqi Government gave a number of conflicting accounts of events at Camp Ashraf in the immediate hours and days after the September 1st massacre. Initially, Maliki's administration held to the line that the deaths had been caused by infighting among the 100 residents, making no mention of the role played by the large contingent of Iraqi Army and police forces stationed inside and around Camp Ashraf.

'The Iraqi government stresses the need for help to deport elements of the MEK who are on Iraqi soil illegally but at the same time confirms its commitment to the safety of souls on its territory'

Statement on the events at Camp Ashraf, Iraqi Prime Minister's Office, 1st September 2013.

A statement made on the day of the massacre by Ali al-Moussaqi, a spokesman for the Prime Ministry, included reference to a "preliminary investigation" that had supposedly been conducted, concluding that the attack was in fact the result of infighting among the residents of Camp Ashraf.³⁷ The Prime Minister's office announced later that day that Maliki had ordered an "investigation" into the attack, and

reiterated that the massacre was presumed to be the caused by infighting.³⁸ Contrary to this, however, two officials within Iraq's Interior Ministry told CNN the same day that security forces had raided the camp after hitting it with mortar rounds.³⁹

This initial contradiction is telling. Considering the exceptionally short chain of command between those ostensibly guarding Camp Ashraf and the Prime Minister himself, via the CLCA – as well as the heavy presence of Iraqi security forces at Camp Ashraf – it seems extremely unlikely that Maliki's administration was not fully aware, and in control, of events at the camp. Certainly, the "initial investigation," which according to Ali al-Moussaqi took place, would have relied on the testimony of those officers stationed at Camp Ashraf, so there is no honest explanation for the differing accounts. A more likely explanation for the contradiction is that a single fabricated account had not yet been distributed to all relevant officers of the Iraqi Government's security forces, thus going some way towards explaining the divergence in accounts.

Indeed, several contradictory accounts were given by Iraqi officials on the day of the massacre; Haqi al-Sharifi, the officer responsible for overseeing the camp, claimed that blasts were caused not by mortars, but by oil and gas containers exploding inside Ashraf: "Not a single soldier entered Camp Ashraf ... There was no attack from outside against the camp, but what seems to have happened is that some barrels of oil and gas inside [Camp] Ashraf exploded. The police are investigating."⁴⁰

Responses to the attack were so divergent that some even came close to admitting the culpability of the Iraqi Government itself; two Iraqi security sources claimed that army units and special forces had opened fire on residents who had stormed a post at the entrance to Camp Ashraf.⁴¹ For its part, Iraq's own National Iraqi News Agency reported "an attack carried out by the Iraqi army in Khalis district of Diyala Province early in the morning," adding that "the attacking force bombed the camp [with] mortar shells ... last midnight for more than an hour before storming the camp."⁴²

Even in the aftermath of the attack, the Iraqi Government's story was self-contradictory. The day after the massacre, the Diyala police chief told Associated Press that "Iraqi police were able to enter the camp Monday, and have begun to investigate the incident,"⁴³ but contradicted himself the following day, telling the same news agency that "Iraqi forensic teams had tried to enter the camp to carry out an investigation, but residents refused to allow them in, and so they withdrew."⁴⁴

The confusion caused by the Iraqi Government about the situation at Camp Ashraf on the day of the massacre, and in the weeks afterwards, was an attempt by Maliki's administration to make itself seem ill-informed and disconnected from events on the ground. In doing so, Maliki was successful in quickly stifling any media interest in the massacre, despite pressure from the NCRI and the PMOI on Western news outlets to investigate. However, the image presented by the plethora of conflicting statements and officials talking about the events at Camp Ashraf – that of a government without effective control of the camp – does not hold true when the organs of the Iraqi Government responsible for the camp are examined.

THE COMMITTEE FOR THE LIQUIDATION OF CAMP ASHRAF (CLCA)

To understand the events at Camp Ashraf within the wider context of Iraqi aggression against the PMOI since 2009, an overview of the lines of communication between the Prime Ministry and those dealing with the camp and its residents is necessary. The main institution within the Iraqi Government that manages Camp Ashraf is the Committee for the Liquidation of Camp Ashraf (CLCA), otherwise known as the Ashraf Suppression Committee. The CLCA forms part of the Iraqi Prime Ministry, and reports directly to the Prime Minister. This semi-formal grouping of security officials has been closely linked to the suppression of PMOI members in Iraq since the beginning of Maliki's premiership, and its combined membership has full control of Camp Ashraf.

Members have included Ali Yeseri, a "senior official" in the Prime Minister's office;⁴⁵ Sadique Mohammad Khazem, who serves as Secretary of the CLCA; Lieutenant Colonel Nezar, the officer in charge of security at Camp Ashraf;⁴⁶ and Lieutenant Heydar Azab Mashi.⁴⁷ The head of the CLCA is currently believed to be Faleh al-Fayad, Iraq's National Security Minister.

Both Yeseri and Fayad report directly to Maliki; as leading members of the CLCA, it is likely that they form the communicative bridge between the Prime Minister and the military commanders at Camp Ashraf. The ramifications of this closeness are huge; the short chain of command between those on the ground at Camp Ashraf and the Prime Minister himself exposes not only Maliki's high level of interest, but also his desire to micromanage the situation the camp. If it is to be believed that the Iraqi Government did organise the attack, as the evidence in this report infers, Maliki himself is guilty of grave violations of both domestic and international law. Indeed, the NCRI issued a statement on 5 October 2013 declaring that they had received evidence from inside Iran that proved Maliki's direct control of the seven hostages taken during the massacre, itself suggesting that Maliki has and does take a close interest in the oppression of PMOI members in Iraq.⁴⁸ It is beyond doubt that the CLCA is the weapon that Maliki wields against the PMOI in Iraq.

Violations of domestic and international law by members of the CLCA have not gone unnoticed; Ali Yeseri, Sadique Mohammad Khazem, Lieutenant Colonel Nezar and Lieutenant Heydar Azab Mashi were all summonsed by the Spanish National Criminal Court, on 17 March 2011, and ordered to appear before the court on 31 March 2011. All failed to attend. The Central Investigative Court of Spain No. 4 stated in a ruling that it would probe the campaign of psychological torture of Camp Ashraf residents, believed to have been initiated in February 2010, noting evidence that "loudspeakers are used to blare threats of murder and mistreatment against residents," as well as condemning the "severe restrictions on [access to] medicine, medical equipment and treatment, food, energy, fuel and educational resources" for the residents. The court also highlighted the obligations of the Iraqi Government, noting that "Article 29 of the

Fourth Geneva Convention states that a government is ultimately responsible for the actions committed by its forces on its territory towards protected persons, which include residents of [Camp] Ashraf.”⁴⁹

Direct Abuse by Committee Members

It would perhaps be impossible to produce a full account of the abuses committed by the CLCA against the residents of Camp Ashraf – and against the PMOI in Iraq in general – since control of the camp was handed over to the Iraqi Government. The literature on this topic is extensive, and much of it can be found in the endnotes of this report. The combined accounts of the actions taken by the Iraqi Government against the residents at Camp Ashraf forms a conclusive narrative sustained and illegal mistreatment, cruelty and intimidation by the Iraqi authorities, led by the CLCA.

Although a more comprehensive account of the actions and statements made by members of the CLCA against residents can be found in Appendix B, the abuses of the two members most closely associated with the day-to-day management of Camp Ashraf – Lieutenant Mashi and Captain Khozeir – are worth noting here.

Figure 2: Abuses by Lt. Mashi and Cpt. Khozeir at Camps Liberty and Ashraf since July 2010

24 Jul 2010: Lt. Mashi attacks Camp Ashraf resident Gholamhossein Niko, beating him severely. He also attacks another resident, Mohammad Afzalian, threatening him with death.

27 Jul 2010: Lt. Mashi encourages the residents of Camp Ashraf to defect to the Iranian regime and provide false reports from Camp Ashraf. He also leads suspected Iranian agents into the camp and stations them in Seen Square.

18 Aug 2010: Lt. Mashi forcibly stops an ambulance from returning patients to Camp Ashraf from a hospital in Baghdad, and issues threats against the patients. He also imposes constraints on terminally ill patients, preventing access to emergency and specialist medical services.⁵⁰

25 Aug 2010: Lt. Mashi stops a vehicle at gunpoint and beats the drivers severely. He insults two Camp Ashraf residents, Rahman Mohammadian and Hossein Kaghazian, and threatens them with arrest, forcible expulsion from Camp Ashraf, and death.⁵¹

15 Oct 2010: Lt. Mashi accompanies Iraqi forces to install 22 new powerful loudspeakers, in addition to the 40 already installed, at Camp Ashraf. These loudspeakers are used for the purposes of psychological torture. Lt. Mashi threatens the residents and breaks the window of one of their cabins.⁵²

17 Oct 2010: 18 Camp Ashraf residents are wounded during an attack led by a unit of the Iraqi security forces under the command of Lt. Mashi, who is reportedly accompanied by Cpt. Khozeir.⁵³

26 Dec 2010: Following the forced removal of the eight Camp Ashraf residents providing medical services to the other residents, Iraqi forces commanded by Lt. Mashi attempt to steal their trailer, together with a crane and lorry hired by the residents. The forces also prevented food, water, and warm clothes from reaching the eight residents, now confined to a different trailer.⁵⁴ The stolen items were valued by the

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

| |
|--|
| residents as being worth up to \$200,000. Lt. Mashi explicitly states that he is acting under the orders of the CLCA and the Prime Minister's office. ⁵⁵ |
| 18 Dec 2011: Cpt. Khozeir and Lt. Mashi prevent an ambulance carrying two emergency patients from leaving Camp Ashraf. ⁵⁶ During the standoff, they insult the residents, pulling their guns on them, throwing stones at them, and threatening to kill them. |
| 7 Mar 2012: Cpt. Khozeir and Lt. Mashi are involved in the breakage of the doors and locks of the residents' trailers, and the disposal of residents' belongings, during the transfer of 400 residents from Camp Ashraf to Camp Liberty. UN monitors take note of the unprovoked abuse by Iraqi forces. ⁵⁷ |
| 8 Apr 2012: Iraqi forces under the command of Cpt. Khozeir and Lt. Mashi attack new arrivals to Camp Liberty with electric batons and iron bars, leading to the injury of 29 residents. They also smash the windows of some vehicles with stones, and slash their tyres with knives. UN monitors again take note of these provocations. ⁵⁸ |
| 26 Sept 2012: Cpt. Khozeir and Lt. Mashi are involved in the production of a film, in collaboration with the Iranian regime, to falsely portray the Iraqi authorities as treating the residents of Camp Ashraf humanely, and the residents as the ones who initiate clashes with Iraqi forces. ⁵⁹ |
| 27 Feb 2013: Iraqi forces, led by Lt. Mashi, block the entry into Camp Liberty of cranes and trucks rented by the residents of Camp Liberty to transfer and install a number of bunkers and protective walls. ⁶⁰ |
| 10 - 21 Aug 2013: Water and electricity is cut off from Camp Ashraf by Iraqi forces, and the delivery of food and daily necessities is blocked. Lt. Mashi is transferred from Camp Liberty to Camp Ashraf to oversee these suppressive measures. ⁶¹ |
| 11 Sept 2013 onwards: Lt. Mashi leads Iraqi forces into Camp Ashraf to steal and destroy the residents' property. ⁶² |

Links to the Iranian Regime

Lieutenant Heidar Azab Mashi is reported to be the CLCA's liaison with the Iranian regime's Ministry of Intelligence and Security (MOIS), and has facilitated the infiltration of Camp Ashraf by MOIS agents.⁶³

In a letter sent by Dr Alejo Vidal-Quadras, then Vice President of the European Parliament, to Prime Minister Nouri al-Maliki on 2 December 2009, Captain Ahmad Khozeir was also named as an agent of the Iranian regime.⁶⁴

On 27 August 2013 at 10.30pm, Maliki and Fayad are reported to have held an out-of-hours emergency meeting with Major-General Qassem Soleimani of the IRGC-QF, during which it is believed that preparations for the September 1st massacre were discussed.⁶⁵

Taken together, these facts suggest a direct line of communication, via the CLCA and the Prime Minister Nouri al-Maliki himself, straight from the heart of the Iranian regime to the Iraqi security forces that stood at the gates of Camp Ashraf on 1 September 2013.

THE SEVEN MISSING RESIDENTS

CAPTURE OF THE SEVEN

During the September 1st massacre, seven residents were abducted, and are currently being held at an unknown location, most likely somewhere inside Iraq. Their names are Mahnaz Azizi, Vajihe Karbalaey, Zahra Ramezany, Lila Nabahat, Fatemeh Tahoori, Fatehma Sakhie and Mohammad Ratebi.⁶⁶

After being taken to Khalis in Diyala Province, the hostages are thought to have been transported to the vicinity of Baghdad International Airport, where they began a hunger strike.⁶⁷ On 10 September 2013, there were reports that the hostages had been transferred to Amarah on the Iran-Iraq border,⁶⁸ although by 16 September 2013 it became clear that these reports were false, and that the hostages had in fact been moved to Baghdad's al-Hout prison.⁶⁹

Meanwhile, Iraqi officials consistently denied the abduction of any Camp Ashraf residents, with one from the Iraqi Prime Minister's office telling the Associated Press on 10 September 2013 that "he had no information about any missing residents." The Diyala police chief further insisted that "no [Camp] Ashraf residents have been transferred out since the shooting."⁷⁰

On 13 September 2013, however, Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty reported that a spokesman from the Iraqi Ministry of Human Rights had confirmed the taking of several hostages by Iraqi forces.⁷¹ Beladi TV, an Iraqi television station affiliated with Prime Minister Nouri al-Maliki's governing coalition, also broadcasted a report, on 14 September 2013, in which it quoted "a security official" as saying that "Iraqi security forces are interrogating a number of PMOI members."⁷² These reports were denied by the Maliki on 20 September 2013.⁷³

On 22 September 2013, it is believed that the seven hostages were moved again, from al-Hout prison to Sharaf prison, also in Baghdad.⁷⁴ Sharaf is known to be under the direct supervision of Nouri al-Maliki's son, Ahmed.⁷⁵ Soon after, there were reports of yet another relocation, although details remain sketchy.

On 25 December, Iran's state-run Islamic Republic News Agency quoted a "knowledgeable [Iraqi] official" as having said that the body of a "PMOI strategist" abducted from Camp Ashraf was in the custody of Iraqi security forces in Baghdad.⁷⁶ Iranian state media had earlier confirmed that an unspecified number of residents had been "arrested" during the massacre.⁷⁷

It is thought that the Iraqi Government is currently attempting to conceal the whereabouts of the hostages by transferring them frequently between various prisons, gaols and unofficial detention facilities.⁷⁸ All available evidence, however, suggests that the hostages – with the possible exception of one, reported to have died – are still in the custody of Iraqi security forces inside Iraq.

STATEMENTS ON THE 7 CAMP ASHRAF HOSTAGES

A number of international and non-governmental organisations have affirmed the disappearance of seven Camp Ashraf residents on 1 September, as well as their presence in Iraq.

On 13 September, the UN High Commissioner for Refugees noted that, "according to reports reaching UNHCR, seven individuals formerly residing in Camp [Ashraf] disappeared from the Camp on 1 September, [and] are being held somewhere in Iraq."⁷⁹

On 19 September, the EU High Representative for Foreign Affairs wrote that she had "reason to believe that up to seven camp residents are being held in captivity near Baghdad,"⁸⁰ while Amnesty International issued a statement on the same day asserting that "the seven Iranian exiles abducted on 1 September are now known to be held by the Iraqi security forces at an unofficial detention facility in central Baghdad."⁸¹

CONCLUSIONS

The problem of the seven residents who were captured during the September 1st massacre is – at the time of writing – ongoing. Although their whereabouts is unknown, all but one are believed with a high level of confidence to be alive and within Iraq. As time passes, however, the likelihood that they will be found is ever-diminishing. What is known is that the hostages were – at least initially – under the control of Iraqi Government forces, whom news reports, eye witness accounts and other evidence confirm as their abductors.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The findings of this report clearly confirm the role of the Iraqi Government – in particular, those officials surrounding outgoing Prime Minister Nouri al-Maliki – in the execution of the September 1st massacre. The attack, which killed 52 unarmed civilians, is not only a crime against humanity, but also a great human tragedy, particularly when one considers that the only crime of which PMOI members in Iraq are guilty is advocating the establishment of liberal democracy in Iran.

The values preached by the PMOI in Iraq would sound very familiar to Western ears. Indeed, Western governments, led by the United States, promised the PMOI an enduring security during the years of US-led military intervention in Iraq. This promise, however, has been broken; and with it, international law.

The membership of the PMOI in Iraq is protected by a number of statutes and agreements:

Protected Persons

On 2 July 2004, an official “Proclamation by the Commander, Multi-National Forces – Iraq” was issued, in which the residents of Camp Ashraf were formally notified that “the United States has confirmed your status as ‘protected persons’ under the Fourth Geneva Convention.”

A letter sent by Major-General William H. Brandenburg on 7 October 2005 explained to the residents in detail the rights to which they are entitled as ‘protected persons’, which include “the right to protection from danger, violence, coercion, and intimidation, and to special protection for the dignity and rights of women.” The letter also stressed that, “under the terms of the Fourth Geneva Convention, [these rights] cannot be renounced, either by the residents of Camp Ashraf or by Coalition Forces.”

Asylum Seekers

In addition to their status as ‘protected persons’ under the Fourth Geneva Convention, on 13 September 2011, the UNHCR announced that the residents

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

of Camp Ashraf are “now formally asylum-seekers under international law [who] ... must be able to benefit from basic protection of their security and well-being.”⁸²

Memorandum of Understanding

The former residents of Camp Ashraf, now at Camp Liberty, are also protected by the terms of a Memorandum of Understanding, signed on 25 December 2011, between the Iraqi Government and UNAMI. In that agreement, the Iraqi Government is committed to “the safety and security of Camp Liberty,” and must ensure that the facility “meet[s] humanitarian and human rights standards.”

The September 1st massacre affirmed the West’s weakness in the face of the most horrific abuses of international law and human rights. As Prof. Marco Sassoli and Dr. Siobhán Wills wrote in December 2008:

“The abandonment and handing over to Iraqi authorities of the PMOI would ... place the PMOI at grave risk of serious violations of their human rights at the hands of the government of Iraq, including the right to life, to freedom from torture and inhumane treatment, deportation, unlawful transfer to another State where they would be at risk of persecution, unlawful confinement and the imposition of punitive measures without being granted the right to a fair hearing. Violations of this nature constitute grave breaches of the Geneva Conventions.”⁸³

With the US troops’ withdrawal from Iraq in 2011, the PMOI was abandoned to the protection of the Iraqi Government. Since then, each and every one of the most basic human rights, which the US had guaranteed PMOI members in Iraq, has been grossly breached through a concerted, targeted and ultimately highly successful campaign of abuse orchestrated by the CLCA at the behest of the Iranian regime.

As Iraq becomes ever more unstable, the need for Western action on the issue of the PMOI in Iraq becomes more, not less, crucial. Although, at the time of writing, Maliki is in the process of leaving office, the Iranian regime will continue to exert control over his successor, particularly through its Iraqi proxy militias, whose strength, wealth and experience has grown enormously as a result of the ongoing conflict in Iraq and Syria. The deepening of sectarian divisions, and the fractionalisation of the Iraqi polity, serves to strengthen the hand of the regime over the government in Baghdad, and therefore over the remaining 2,800 PMOI members at Camp Liberty, as well as the missing seven. In such an environment, where physical strength equates to political power and Iraqi militias are taking orders directly from Iran, the position of PMOI members remaining in Iraq becomes ever more precarious.

“I participated in the gathering of the bodies of the September 1st massacre victims, and I transferred them to the makeshift morgue we had set up in [Camp] Ashraf, so every single visage has been etched into my mind. Sometimes I go back to the memories of those days and I ask God, “What kind of monstrous creation could commit such crimes?” I never thought there were people who could commit such atrocities.” – **Esmaeil Rajabi, survivor of the September 1st massacre.**⁸⁴

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the UN and US recognise their failings with regard to the protection of the PMOI members in Iraq since the 2003 invasion of the country.
2. That the UN launches an official investigation into the conduct of the United Nations Assistance Mission in Iraq (UNAMI) and its former chief, Martin Kobler, and publishes its findings.
3. That Western governments immediately offer asylum to the PMOI members currently incarcerated by the Iraqi Government at Camp Liberty, and that the UN expedites this process with the full provision of resources appropriate to the task.
4. That the UN, EU, Western governments and independent NGOs conduct their own analyses of the events that transpired on 1 September 2013 at Camp Ashraf, as well as of conditions in which PMOI members currently reside in Iraq, and act accordingly to ameliorate these conditions.
5. That the UN and Western governments take action to ensure the security of those at Camp Liberty, including the use of economic sanctions and other appropriate measures against the Iranian regime – from where the oppression of the PMOI in Iraq stems – and deploy peacekeepers at Camp Liberty until asylum is found for them outside Iraq.

APPENDIX A: LIST OF STATEMENTS ON THE MASSACRE

| APPENDIX A.1: STATEMENTS BY UN OFFICIALS | |
|--|--|
| 1 September 2013 | <i>"We deeply regret the tragic events of today, which have reportedly led to the killing and injuring of several camp residents ... We are closely following up on the developments on the ground and we are conducting our own assessment of the situation."</i> Eliana Nabaa, spokeswoman for UNAMI. ⁸⁵ |
| | <i>"The priority for the Iraqi Government is to provide immediate medical assistance to the injured and to ensure their security and safety against any violence from any side."</i> Gyorgy Busztin, acting UN envoy to Iraq. ⁸⁶ |
| | Under its humanitarian mandate, the UN Assistance Mission in Iraq <i>"is closely following up on developments on the ground, and is using all possibly means to conduct its own assessment of the situation."</i> Gyorgy Busztin, acting UN envoy to Iraq. ⁸⁷ |
| | <i>"The United Nations deplores the tragic events at Camp Ashraf today that have reportedly left 47 killed ... [Ban Ki-moon] expresses his sorrow and extends his deepest condolences to the families of the victims."</i> |
| | The resettlement to Camp Liberty is a priority for UNAMI, in whose work Mr Ban reiterated his <i>"full support ... and his absolute confidence."</i> Mr Ban urged the Iraqi Government to restore security in the camp, and stressed that it is its responsibility to <i>"ensure the safety and security"</i> of the residents. He also called on the Iraqi Government to promptly investigate the incident and disclose the findings. Office of UN Secretary General Ban Ki-moon. ⁸⁸ |
| 3 September 2013 | <i>"I call on the Iraqi Government to ensure that a thorough, impartial and transparent investigation into this atrocious crime</i> |

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| | <p><i>is conducted without delay and that the results of the investigation are made public ... Until the camps' residents are relocated to safety, all measures must be taken to protect their lives."</i></p> <p>Gyorgy Busztin, acting UN envoy to Iraq.⁸⁹</p> <p><i>"While we are still seeking details of what occurred, we also call up on the Iraqi Government to quickly launch a full investigation to establish the facts and disclose the circumstances surrounding this attack."</i></p> <p>Cecile Pouilly, spokesperson for the Office of the High Commissioners for Human Rights (OHCHR), to journalists in Geneva.⁹⁰</p> |
| 19 September 2013 | <p><i>"There is no way for [UNAMI and] the American embassy not to know where [the seven hostages] are ... When the 36 [kidnapped Camp Ashraf residents] in 2009 were taken from Khalis they disappeared and I followed them [to] where they were. They were in Baghdad, in the Green Zone, 50 meters away from [the] UNAMI headquarters [and] 50 meters from [the] Iraqi Presidency, in a building with a label on it [reading] 'High Council of National Education' ... [This building] was used as a secret prison. I went to visit them in the presence of the Iraqi security officers. I told them, 'now you are my neighbours, and I will visit you every day'. The next day, I went to visit them, [and] they were removed.'</i></p> <p>Tahar Boumedra, UNAMI advisor on Camp Ashraf, 2009-12. Testimony at the UN headquarters in Geneva.⁹¹</p> |
| 19 November 2013 | <p><i>"The UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR) calls for renewed efforts from states to relocate former Camp Ashraf residents ... UNHCR encourages all Member States to share in the international efforts, admit residents and offer them a long-term solution. UNHCR and the United Nations Assistance Mission in Iraq also call upon the Government of Iraq to take all possible measures to ensure the safety of the residents. UNHCR and UNAMI remain gravely concerned about the fate of seven missing individuals formerly residing in Camp [Ashraf] who disappeared on 1 September and call on the authorities to locate them, ensure their wellbeing and safeguard them against any forcible return."</i></p> <p>Statement by the UNHCR.⁹²</p> |
| 9 December 2013 | <p>A group of UN independent experts called on the Iraqi Government to establish the fate and whereabouts of seven missing residents of Camp Ashraf, expressing serious concern about the lack of information from the Iraqi authorities regarding the results of ongoing investigations into the attack.</p> <p><i>"We call upon the Government of Iraq to speed up the investigations in order to disclose the fate and whereabouts of the individuals," the UN Working Group on Enforced or</i></p> |

Involuntary Disappearances said, recalling that, at some point, Iraqi forces allegedly admitted having these individuals in custody.

“International law clearly requires Governments to ensure that all allegations of killings are investigated in a prompt, effective and impartial manner, irrespective of who the perpetrator is ... Failure to do so is a violation of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.”

Christof Heyns, UN Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions.

“The UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention has consistently held that the detention in Camp Ashraf is arbitrary ... The Iraqi Government has a particular responsibility to protect the detainees against human rights violations such as the recent deaths and abductions, and must now instigate independent investigations, end the detention regime, and in the meantime provide effective protection to those who remain in detention.”

Mads Andenas, Head of the UN Working Group on Arbitrary Detention.

“Detention in secret places can facilitate the perpetration of torture and other ill-treatment and can in itself constitute a form of such treatment ... Iraq’s obligations under international law are clear, the Government shall not expel, return, extradite or in any other way transfer a person to another State where there are substantial grounds for believing that the person would be in danger of being subjected to torture.”

Juan E. Méndez, UN Special Rapporteur on Torture.

“I condemn the lack of proper investigation of the massacres and the impunity of those responsible for them ... Grave crimes of this nature, and the impunity that has accompanied them, entail violations of numerous international treaty provisions and constitute an assault on the rule of law, an affront to the international community and a threat to the international order ... the families of the killed and disappeared are entitled to the right to know what happened to their loved ones, and to adequate reparation for the suffering endured.”

Alfred de Zayas, the UN Independent Expert.

The group of experts urged the Iraqi authorities “to take all necessary measures to clarify the whereabouts of the missing individuals, guarantee their safety and rights, and prevent their extradition to Iran.”⁹³

APPENDIX A.2: STATEMENTS BY US OFFICIALS

1 September 2013 *“The United States strongly condemns the terrible events that took place at Camp Ashraf today, which according to various reports resulted in the deaths of and injuries to numerous camp residents. Our condolences go out to the families of the victims and those who were injured in today’s violence.*

“We are deeply concerned about these reports and are in regular contact with the United Nations Assistance Mission in Iraq (UNAMI), as well as Government of Iraq officials. We support UNAMI's efforts to conduct its own assessment of the situation and call on the Government of Iraq to fully support those efforts.

“We further call on Iraqi authorities to act with urgency to immediately ensure medical assistance to the wounded and to secure the camp against any further violence or harm to the residents. We underscore the responsibility of the Government of Iraq and all relevant stakeholders to ensure the safety and security of residents at both Camp Ashraf and Camp [Liberty], and we affirm the call by UNAMI for a full and independent investigation into this terrible and tragic event. Those found to be responsible must be held fully accountable.”

Mari Harf, Deputy Spokesperson, Office of the Spokesperson, State Department.⁹⁴

6 September 2013 *“We are continuing to follow with urgency the situation at Camp Ashraf in Iraq. The United States reiterates its condemnation of the horrific attack that took place on September 1 and we express our condolences to the families and friends of the victims.*

“We further reiterate our support for the United Nations Assistance Mission (UNAMI) and its efforts to conduct an independent fact finding investigation into this terrible event and to document what took place. We have called on the Government of Iraq to fully support UNAMI’s efforts to conduct a full investigation of its own and to help find and return to safety those who are missing. We insist that the perpetrators of this barbarous act be brought to justice.

“We also note the troubling statements issued by the Iranian Revolutionary Guard Corps (IRGC) praising the attack, and call on the Government of Iran to use whatever influence it might have with groups that may be holding missing persons from the camp to secure their immediate release.

“Regarding the immediate situation at Camp Ashraf, we urge all parties to cooperate with a plan proposed by UNAMI to ensure the safe and secure relocation of the survivors to Camp [Liberty] as soon as possible. Consistent with this plan, we call on the Government of Iraq to move expeditiously to enhance security structures within Camp [Liberty], pursuant to the plan discussed with UNAMI, and we call on the MEK to make all necessary preparations to move remaining residents at Camp Ashraf to Camp [Liberty] in full cooperation with UNAMI. The United States stands behind the UNAMI efforts to resolve this crisis.

“The State Department has appointed a Senior Advisor for MEK Resettlement, Jonathan Winer, to oversee our efforts to help resettle the residents of Camp [Liberty] to safe, permanent, and secure locations outside of Iraq, in addition to those countries, such as Albania, that have admirably assisted the United Nations in this important humanitarian mission.”

Mari Harf, Deputy Spokesperson, Office of the Spokesperson, State Department.⁹⁵

11 October 2013

A bipartisan group of lawmakers urged the US Government to save the seven Camp Ashraf hostages, protect Camp Liberty, and resettle PMOI members in America as political refugees.

“[The massacre is] shameful on the part of the Iraqi Government that has no shame, but it’s shameful on the part of the United States as well ... It’s time that we grant political asylum to all of the people of Camp Liberty, and to end this tragic episode before there are any more massacres in Iraq.”

Rep. Dana Rohrabacher (R-CA).

“We’ve stood by and watched as [Camp Ashraf residents] have been systematically slaughtered by Iraqi troops using weapons and equipment supplied by the United States and training provided by the United States, while the United States government has stood by and done nothing ... All 52 people that were killed at Ashraf had ID cards issued by the United States that recognised them as ‘Protected Persons’.”

Michael Mukasey, 81st Attorney General of the United States.

“Prime Minister Maliki needs to be told, and will be told, that the hostages need to be released as soon as possible ... And we need to be calling on John Kerry, which we will, to uphold the US commitment to residents who were deemed protected persons in 2004, and as asylum seekers by the UN refugee agency in 2011.”

Congressman Steve Cohen (D-TN).

"[The US has] an obligation to ensure the security, safety, and basic rights of those refugees. We must do all that we can to ensure that no more innocent lives are lost."
Rep. Judy Chu (D-CA).⁹⁶

APPENDIX A.3: STATEMENTS BY BRITISH OFFICIALS

2 September 2013 *"I am appalled to hear of the violence at Camp Ashraf in Iraq, which we understand has resulted in the death of many camp residents. We condemn this utterly, and our thoughts go out to the families of the victims. Our Embassy in Baghdad is in close contact with the United Nations Assistance Mission in Iraq, who are making an urgent assessment of the situation. We support their work, and call on the Government of Iraq to assist the UN fully. The Government of Iraq must also do everything necessary to ensure the safety of the residents and care for survivors, and must conduct an urgent and transparent investigation into what took place, and ensure those responsible are brought to justice."*
Statement by Alistair Burt, Foreign Office Minister.⁹⁷

12 September 2013 *"I welcome the successful and peaceful transfer of the remaining residents from Camp Ashraf to Camp Liberty yesterday, and commend the camp's residents for taking this important step. I am grateful to the United Nations Assistance Mission for Iraq (UNAMI) for all that they have done to reach this point, and to the Government of Iraq for facilitating the move. It is important that residents, including Camp Liberty's leadership, now engage fully with the process of resettlement to third countries, and I am grateful to the UNHCR for their ongoing efforts."*
"I also reiterate my utter condemnation of the appalling attack on the residents of Camp Ashraf on 1 September, which resulted in the deaths of 52 people. I strongly urge the Government of Iraq to carry out its investigation into the killings quickly and transparently. I am concerned by reports that a number of residents remain missing following the attack, and urge that all necessary measures are taken to locate missing residents. I also call again on the Government of Iraq, which is responsible for security at Camp Liberty, to take all necessary steps to ensure residents' safety."
Statement by Alistair Burt, Foreign Office Minister.⁹⁸

11 November 2013 *"I commend the resolve of the hunger strikes and I admire their discipline and determination. They deserve every appreciation and recognition for paying a physical price for the freedom of the Iranian people and members of the Iranian opposition who are being persecuted, threatened and killed by the Iranian regime and its proxies in Iraq."*

“What happened in Camp Ashraf on September 1 was nothing short of a crime against humanity, and the culprits must be brought to justice ... I and my colleagues from both Houses of Parliament have previously and again call for an independent international investigative team to embark on a fact-finding mission and to report their findings to the international community.

“The UN, the EU, and the US and our government must pressure the government of Iraq until it releases the seven hostages. Further, the UN must put Blue Helmets on the ground at Camp Liberty by sending a monitoring team there as a matter of urgency.”

Dr Matthew Offord, Conservative MP for Hendon in the UK House of Commons and member of the British Parliamentary Committee for Iran Freedom (BPCIF).⁹⁹

APPENDIX A.4: STATEMENTS BY OTHER ORGANISATIONS

2 September 2013 *“I condemn in the strongest terms the killings that took place at Camp Ashraf yesterday, which according to various reports claimed the lives of numerous camp residents. My sincere condolences go out to the families of the victims and I extend my wishes for a speedy recovery to those who were injured in yesterday's violence.*

“The circumstances in which this brutal incident took place must be clarified and those found to be responsible must be held fully accountable. I welcome the decision of the Government of Iraq to open an inquiry. I further call on the Iraqi authorities to ensure that the residents of the camp are protected from any further violence and that the wounded obtain all necessary medical assistance.

“The EU is committed to a peaceful solution of the Camp Ashraf issue and I fully support UNAMI's decision, under its humanitarian mandate, to conduct an independent and transparent assessment of this tragic event. I call on all parties and particularly the Government of Iraq to facilitate UNAMI's fact-finding efforts.”

Statement by EU High Representative Catherine Ashton.¹⁰⁰

“On previous occasions, the Iraqi authorities have failed to conduct effective investigations into attacks on camps housing Iranian exiles. This has meant that no one has been held accountable for these incidents, and that residents live in

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| | <p><i>constant fear for their safety. The authorities must ensure that an inquiry into yesterday's violence is promptly carried out and that it is independent, transparent and in full conformity with international standards ... The failure of the Iraqi authorities to investigate and bring to justice those allegedly responsible for previous attacks is unacceptable and is putting lives at risk. The Government of Iraq is responsible for the safety and security of all the residents of Camp Liberty and Camp Ashraf and must take immediate measures to ensure their protection."</i></p> <p>Statement by Hassiba Hadj Sahraoui, Deputy Director for the Middle East and North Africa at Amnesty International.¹⁰¹</p> |
| 11 September 2013 | <p>Amnesty International called for "<i>urgent action</i>" with regard to the seven Iranians abducted from Camp Ashraf, asking for support in:</p> <p><i>"Calling on the Iraqi authorities to immediately clarify the whereabouts and the legal status of Fatemah Tahoori, Vajihe Karbalaey, Mahnaz Azizi, Lila Nabahat, Zahra Ramezani, Fatema Sakhie, and Mohammad Ratebi;</i></p> <p><i>"Urging authorities to ensure that, if held in Iraqi custody, the seven people are protected from torture and other ill-treatment and that they are released immediately unless they are charged with an internationally recognizable criminal offence;</i></p> <p><i>"Urging them not to forcibly return the seven individuals to Iran where they would be at risk of torture and possibly execution;</i></p> <p><i>"Reminding the Iraqi government of its obligations under international law not to forcibly return individuals to a country where they would be at risk of serious human rights violations, including torture."</i>¹⁰²¹⁰³</p> <p>Struan Stevenson MEP (Conservative, Scotland) issued a statement condemning the Iraqi Government and the Iranian regime, accusing the latter of having ordered the massacre. He demanded action from the UN, US and the EU, asking that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The seven hostages must be "<i>rescued and released,</i>" and returned to either Camp Ashraf or Camp Liberty; 2. The UN immediately send Blue Helmets to Camp Ashraf and Liberty to protect the residents; 3. There must be a full, international, independent inquiry into what he termed the "<i>horrific atrocity</i>" that took place in Camp Ashraf; and that those found guilty should be "<i>indicted for murder and brought before the International Criminal Courts. These are war crimes of the worst variety.</i>"¹⁰⁴ <p><i>"The West – distracted by the serious crisis in Syria – has not been able to give sufficient attention to a terrible massacre in</i></p> |

Iraq in recent days, but it must now step in to prevent further bloodshed and it must insist on the release of seven Camp Ashraf hostages who are about to be handed over to the Iranians ...

“The Chairman of the European Parliament’s Iraq delegation, Struan Stevenson MEP, said: ‘The atrocity committed by Iraqi forces is an affront to the West and the response from EU, US and UN leaders has been far from robust. Our silence is allowing Iraq to get away with liquidating a refugee camp that we have a duty to protect. We must also demand a full and independent UN investigation into the massacre with those responsible held accountable for crimes against humanity.

“It is quite clear that if the remaining hostages are handed over to Iran, they face almost certain torture and execution.

“The West must stop standing by and start shouting at Baghdad. Only UN Blue Helmets at the entrance to Camp Ashraf and Camp Liberty will protect the remaining refugees. And only a concerted and loud effort by the EU, US and UN will stop Iraq from handing over refugees to a regime that will almost certainly harm them.

“The West had an opportunity to take refugees from Camps Ashraf and Liberty and guarantee their safety. It failed to live up to its responsibility. It now has another opportunity to defend the lives of innocent refugees under threat from the state in which they have sought refuge. If the West continues to fail in its duty to protect the residents of Camps Ashraf and Liberty then it will send out a terrible signal about our resolve that we will live to regret. Unfortunately the residents of [Camps] Ashraf and Liberty will not.’

“Charles Tannock, European Conservatives and Reformists group foreign affairs spokesman, said:

“I call upon EU High Representative Catherine Ashton to demand from the Iraqi Government not to hand over refugees to a regime that will surely endanger their lives. The West’s response to the recent atrocity in Ashraf has been muted at best, and our silence allows the Iraqi government to believe it can continue to act with impunity.

“We cannot allow this situation to continue. The credibility of the West in protecting fundamental UN principles is at stake. We must not allow Syria to act as an excuse for our inaction.”

Statement by the European Conservatives and Reformists Group.¹⁰⁵

APPENDIX B: MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE FOR THE LIQUIDATION OF CAMP ASHRAF (CLCA)

NOURI AL-MALIKI

Maliki founded the CLCA in 2006, and has stated repeatedly that he regards the residents of Camp Ashraf as members of a terrorist organisation.¹⁰⁶ He has also, on occasion, referred to them as “a criminal gang,”¹⁰⁷ to whom his government is “determined to put an end.”¹⁰⁸ To this end, he has said that his government will “coerce them not to remain in Iraq.”¹⁰⁹ Although he claims that he does “not want to hand [these] people over to Iran, or to kill, oppress, or starve them,” he has intimated that he will do all of these things if necessary, because “their illegal presence [in Iraq] must end.”¹¹⁰ Maliki has also threatened to “sue those ... [foreign] governments that provide refuge” to the Camp Ashraf residents, thereby impeding the possibility of their peaceful resettlement abroad.¹¹¹

FALEH AL-FAYAD

Fayad was appointed as acting National Security Minister (previously National Security Advisor) by Maliki on 8 June 2011, and it has since been claimed that he is also the head of the CLCA.¹¹² His wide-ranging responsibilities over security in the country have made him one of the most influential actors on the Iraqi political scene during Maliki’s premiership.

While the April 2011 Camp Ashraf massacre was underway, Tahar Boumedra recalls visiting Fayad at his home to confront him about the ongoing situation. “Fayad’s response,” Boumedra recounts, “was to tell us that we had merely been alarmed by false rumours. I pulled out my mobile phone and asked him to speak to the people on the ground to hear for himself what was happening. Instead, he made his own call ... Fayad then reiterated that nothing had happened ... I requested authorisation to visit

[Camp] Ashraf that day, [but] Fayad turned down the request.” Even days after the massacre took place, during a meeting with UNAMI and US diplomatic officials on 14 April 2011, Fayad continued to deny that it had happened. When the idea of an independent commission of inquiry into the massacre was put forward by participants in the meeting, he responded, “No one will dictate to us how to do an inquiry.” Fayad also has used the derogatory term “Monafeqin” to refer to the residents of Camp Ashraf.

On 18 February 2012, when the first convoy of Camp Ashraf residents were being transferred to Camp Liberty, Fayad acted as the spokesperson for the Iraqi Government, stating that Maliki’s administration saw the presence of the PMOI in Iraq as a source of tension with neighbouring countries, presumably Iran.¹¹³

His involvement with the CLCA has not gone unnoticed and, on the 18 December 2013, the Spanish courts made the decision to probe him as part of an investigation of the attacks that had taken place in 2009, 2011 and 2013 at Camp Ashraf.

A decision cited by the Madrid Central Court, dated 21 November 2013, said that Fayad would be subject of an investigation into “supposed crimes against the international community” as the head of the “Ashraf Committee” affiliated to Prime Minister Nouri al-Maliki. The investigation

‘Iraq inherited a number of problems and legacies left by the former regime, and they hurt Iraq and represent a source of tension in Iraq’s relations with neighbouring countries. We reject the presence of this unwanted organisation on Iraqi soil since it infringes on Iraq’s sovereignty’

Statement on the transfer of Camp Ashraf residents to Camp Liberty, Faleh al-Fayadh, 18th February 2012.

began after a lawsuit filed against Fayad “as a person responsible for serious violations of the Fourth Geneva Convention and his supposed involvement in the massacres of 8 of April, 2011 [‘35 murders and 337 cases of wilful injury’] and the first of September 2013 [‘52 murders and 7 abductions ... [and] torture of and bodily harm to (Camp) Ashraf residents’] against people protected by the Fourth Geneva Convention and reside in Camp Ashraf.”¹¹⁴ The order also states that “killings, injuries, noise bombardment, denial of food and healthcare – nothing can happen at Ashraf without the knowledge of the Committee members and in particular of Faleh al-Fayad. In the civil and military hierarchy he was the person in charge of the operation on April 8, 2011, under the orders of the Prime Minister, who is Commander-in-chief of the Iraqi armed forces. In security matters throughout the country, including [Camp] Ashraf, Faleh al-Fayad is the person in charge.”¹¹⁵

MOWAFFAK AL-RUBAIE

Rubaie served as the chairman of the CLCA until 2009, and has openly described the residents of Camp Ashraf as “members of a foreign terrorist organisation,” namely the

PMOI, which he describes as an “indoctrinated and tightly disciplined organisation of extremist zealots who have employed terrorism.” Its members, he says, “have been brainwashed.”¹¹⁶ As such, Rubaie believes that the Iraqi Government “must liberate them from this poison. This act will at first be painful. There is no alternative than to begin this painful act.”¹¹⁷ By “painful,” Mr Rubaie means “intolerable,” and has even suggested that “Iraqi security forces shall enter the base [Camp Ashraf] and ... conduct attacks” against the residents.¹¹⁸ He has also threatened to “hand over to Iran” those Camp Ashraf residents who he alleges “have Iranian blood on their hands,” which would inevitably mean sending those people to their torture and execution.¹¹⁹ For Rubaie, Camp Ashraf and its residents are a “cancerous disease [that has] infected the body of Iraq.”¹²⁰

ALI AL-YESERI

Yeseri is believed to have served as the chairman of the CLCA between 2009 and 2011. According to Tahar Boumedra, former Director of the Human Rights Office of the United Nations Assistance Mission in Iraq (UNAMI), Ali al-Yeseri met with UN officials in Baghdad on 12 August 2009 and told them that his government had discovered “heavy weapons, including rockets and rocket launchers, inside [Camp] Ashraf.” Mr Boumedra notes, however, that “a document of 20 April 2009 from the Iraqi Ministry of Interior, issued following a search [of Camp Ashraf] with police dogs on 18 April 2009, confirmed the absence of weapons in the Camp.” Mr Boumedra therefore concludes that the allegations made against the residents of Camp Ashraf by Yeseri were “devoid of any credibility,” and that “the man [Yeseri] was either misled by the forces on the ground, or he intentionally made baseless claims.” Other allegations made by Yeseri, during a conversation about the July 2009 Camp Ashraf massacre with Mr Boumedra on 4 August, include the claim “that Camp Ashraf residents were shot by the MEK and not by Iraqi forces;” that “the dead were dissidents within the group [the MEK];” and “that there were 100 injured police officers and 13 injured soldiers on the Iraqi side.” Mr Boumedra recalls, however, that “UNAMI had not been presented with any evidence to substantiate [these] allegation[s],” and that “evidence and testimonies presented to the [UNAMI] fact-finding mission [to Camp Ashraf] clearly established responsibility as belonging solely to the Iraqi security forces ... for the shooting, the reckless and dangerous driving and the looting [that occurred following the massacre].”

Yeseri, alongside Sadique Mohammad Khazem, Lieutenant Colonel Nezar, and Lieutenant Heydar Azab Mashi was summonsed by the Central Investigative Court of Spain No. 4, which in March 2011 issued a statement alleging that he, and the CLCA, had breached the Geneva Convention.¹²¹

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

HAQQI KARIM

Like Yeseri, Karim has falsely claimed, during a meeting with UN and British and American consular officials in Baghdad on 18 July 2010, that there are weapons in Camp Ashraf belonging to the residents. He is also on record as having referred to the Camp Ashraf residents as “Monafeqin,” a derogatory term commonly used by the Iranian regime to refer to the PMOI that translates literally as “hypocrites.”

SADIQUE MOHAMMAD KHAZEM

Sadique Mohammad Khazem is the Secretary of the CLCA.¹²² Khazem has been under investigation on several occasions by Western governments for his role in the abuse of Camp Ashraf residents, and was in June 2012 released by French authorities. He had been detained in Paris after a former resident of Camp Ashraf made the accusation that he had directed and exercised torture at the camp. Further accusations include that the Iraqi official exercised war crimes in the camp in 2009.¹²³

NEZAR, MASHI AND KHOZEIR

Lieutenant Colonel Nezar and Lieutenant Heydar Azab Mashi were officers previously in charge of security for Ashraf.¹²⁴ Both are accused of being affiliated to the IRCG-QF – the external action force of the Iranian regime – by the NCRI, and are known to have beaten, battered and insulted the residents of Camp Ashraf, and have stolen their property on several occasions.¹²⁵ Alongside Captain Ahmad Khozeir, these men are believed to have been actively involved in the massacres of July 2009, April 2011 and September 2013.¹²⁶ It is believed that during the 2010 attack on the residents of Camp Ashraf, the Iraqi forces were under the command of Nezar and Mashi.¹²⁷

ENDNOTES

-
- ¹ <http://thehill.com/policy/international/244733-former-un-human-rights-chief-in-baghdad-tahar-boumedra-why-i-quit-the-un-in-iraq>
- ² <https://www.amnesty.org/en/appeals-for-action/iraq-authorities-must-investigate-excessive-use-force-camp-ashraf>
- ³ http://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/brian-binley/un-us-and-uk-must-protect_b_909910.html
- ⁴ <http://www.omct.org/urgent-campaigns/urgent-interventions/iraq/2009/10/d20292/>
- ⁵ <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/on-the-anniversary-of-april-8-camp-ashraf-massacre-isdci-calls-on-the-international-community-to-protect-members-of-iranian-opposition-mek-living-in-iraq-146458875.html>
- ⁶ <https://www.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/iraq-investigate-deadly-violence-camp-ashraf-2011-04-08>
- ⁷ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/13086-pmoi-s-casualty-at-camp-liberty-attack-rises-to-eight>
- ⁸ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/news/ashraf-liberty/13975-urgent-camp-liberty-attacked-simultaneous-with-iranian-regime-s-election-masquerade>
- ⁹ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/15665-camp-liberty-december-26-rocket-attack-death-toll-raises-to-four>
- ¹⁰ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/15608-maliki-s-notorious-operative-takes-responsibility-for-attack-on-camp-liberty>
- ¹¹ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/13984-iraq-attempt-to-whitewash-crimes-of-attack-on-camp-liberty>
- ¹² http://www.perseus-strategies.com/news/documents/AshrafReport10-30-13FINAL_001.pdf
- ¹³ http://www.perseus-strategies.com/news/documents/AshrafReport10-30-13FINAL_001.pdf
- ¹⁴ "They were speaking Arabic with an Iraqi accent. I have spent many years in Iraq and have dealt with a lot of Iraqis, especially soldiers, and I had no doubt that these people were Iraqi." Akbari, Alireza. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. February 8, 2014.
- ¹⁵ "It was about 4.45am that I exited the residential area; I reached one of the locations where we guarded our property at about 4.55am. At about 5.00am I was checking the area when I took note that a vehicle that was usually parked in the gap in the T-Walls west of Tulip Square and blocked the only entrance to the camp was removed." Solaymani, Abdul Hossein. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 9, 2014.
- ¹⁶ Akbari, Alireza. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. February 8, 2014.
- ¹⁷ Lesani, Ali Asghar. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 8, 2014.
- ¹⁸ Lesani, Ali Asghar. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 8, 2014.
- ¹⁹ Lesani, Ali Asghar. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 8, 2014.
- ²⁰ Rajabi, Esmaeil. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. January 9, 2014.
- ²¹ Rajabi, Esmaeil. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. January 9, 2014.
- ²² Rajabi, Esmaeil. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. January 9, 2014.
- ²³ Rajabi, Esmaeil. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. January 9, 2014.
- ²⁴ Rajabi, Esmaeil. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. January 9, 2014.
- ²⁵ http://www.perseus-strategies.com/news/documents/AshrafReport10-30-13FINAL_001.pdf
- ²⁶ It should be noted at this point that Qeisi lives, according to the former residents at Camp Ashraf, who have been in contact with him on many occasions, less than an hour away from the Camp.
- ²⁷ Solaymani, Abdul Hossein. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 9, 2014; Alawi, Javad. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 9, 2014.
- ²⁸ Valipour, Mahmoud. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 12, 2014.

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

-
- ²⁹ Valipour, Mahmoud. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 12, 2014.
- ³⁰ http://www.perseus-strategies.com/news/documents/AshrafReport10-30-13FINAL_001.pdf
- ³¹ Solaymani, Abdul Hossein. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 9, 2014.
- ³² Akbari, Alireza. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. February 8, 2014.
- ³³ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14594-upon-the-request-of-mrs-rajavi-and-based-on-assurances-provided-by-the-u-s-state-department-ashraf-residents-went-to-camp-liberty>
- ³⁴ Valipour, Mahmoud. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 12, 2014.
- ³⁵ Valipour, Mahmoud. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. March 12, 2014.
- ³⁶ Akbari, Alireza. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. February 8, 2014.
- ³⁷ <http://p.washingtontimes.com/news/2013/sep/1/least-47-iranian-exiles-killed-iraqs-camp-ashraf/?page=all>
- ³⁸ <http://edition.cnn.com/2013/09/01/world/meast/iraq-violence/>
- ³⁹ <http://edition.cnn.com/2013/09/01/world/meast/iraq-violence/>
- ⁴⁰ <http://english.alarabiya.net/en/News/middle-east/2013/09/01/Blasts-reported-at-Iran-exile-camp-in-Iraq-.html>
- ⁴¹ <http://www.reuters.com/article/2013/09/01/us-iraq-violence-camp-idUSBRE98004H20130901>
- ⁴² "Killing of 19 and injuring dozens of Iranian refugees in Camp Ashraf in Diyala by Iraqi military forces," National Iraqi News Agency, 1 September 2013.
- ⁴³ "Iraq promises probe into Iranian exile killings," Associated Press, 2 September 2013.
- ⁴⁴ "UN urges safety for Iranian exiles after 52 killed," Associated Press, 3 September 2013.
- ⁴⁵ Yeseri was formerly the head of the CLCA, but no longer serves in office.
- ⁴⁶ Nezar left Ashraf shortly after the April 2011 massacre.
- ⁴⁷ http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/images/stories/juan_garces.pdf
- ⁴⁸ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14839-documents-show-iraq-s-maliki-himself-controls-camp-ashraf-hostages>
- ⁴⁹ http://iranliberty.org.uk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=1604:spanish-court-probes-psychological-torture-of-ashraf-residents-&catid=33:ashraf&Itemid=60
- ⁵⁰ http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/images/stories/juan_garces.pdf
- ⁵¹ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/8727-ploys-by-iranian-regime-and-iraqi-committee-to-intensify-psychological-war-against-ashraf>
- ⁵² <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/8760-iraqi-forces-block-one-street-in-ashraf-and-severely-beat-two-residents>
- ⁵³ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/9105-iranian-regimes-agents-set-up-22-new-loudspeakers-in-camp-ashraf>
- ⁵⁴ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/news/ashraf-liberty/9116-number-of-injured-during-iraqi-forces-attack-on-ashraf-residents-reach-18-more-women-wounded>
- ⁵⁵ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/9540-ashraf-residents-attacked-in-hospital-dozens-beaten-and-wounded>
- ⁵⁶ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/9549-stealing-200000-worth-of-ashraf-residents-property-by-iraqi-forces-under-iraqi-prime-ministers-command>
- ⁵⁷ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/11547-iraqi-officers-pull-the-guns-on-residents-of-ashraf-and-threaten-to-kill-them>
- ⁵⁸ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/11782-ashraf-residents-another-400-are-moving-to-camp-liberty>
- ⁵⁹ http://www.iranliberty.org.uk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=2704:iraqi-forces-attack-on-ashrafis-while-loading-fourth-groups-belongings-for-transfer-to-liberty&catid=33:camp-ashraf-liberty&Itemid=102
- ⁶⁰ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/president-elect/12296-to-counter-international-outrage-against-suppressive-measures-subjected-to-ashraf-residents-quds-force-mullahs-embassy-assigned-to-produce-a-movie-on-ashraf-to-distort-facts>
- ⁶¹ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/news/ashraf-liberty/12966-iraqi-forces-obstructing-protective-measures-in-camp-liberty>
- ⁶² <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14407-iraqi-forces-deny-iranians-in-camp-ashraf-water-electricity-food>

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

-
- ⁶² <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14726-maliki-s-forces-plunder-and-steal-camp-ashraf-property>
- ⁶³ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/8599-suppressive-and-provocative-measures-against-ashraf-by-iraqi-committee-in-pm-office>
- ⁶⁴ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/8767-urgent-iraqi-forces-preparing-for-an-attack-on-ashraf>
- ⁶⁵ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/camp-ashraf-massacre-sept-2013/14529-iran-suleimani-acknowledges-role-in-camp-ashraf-massacre>
- ⁶⁶ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/news/ashraf-liberty/14501-iranian-resistance-calls-on-the-us-and-the-un-for-urgent-release-of-7-hostages>
- ⁶⁷ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14570-seven-ashraf-residents-who-were-taken-hostage-are-held-near-baghdad-airport-and-are-planned-to-be-extradited-to-iran>
- ⁶⁸ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14579-urgent-iraq-transfers-camp-ashraf-hostages-from-baghdad-by-helicopters-to-extradite-to-iran>
- ⁶⁹ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14638-camp-ashraf-hostages-in-baghdad-in-al-hout-prison-in-airport-area>
- ⁷⁰ "Iranian exiles say 7 members held by Baghdad," Associated Press, 10 September 2013
- ⁷¹ <http://www.iraqhurr.org/archive/news/20130912/1093/1093.html?id=25104078>
- ⁷² <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14627-iraqi-ministry-attempts-to-cover-up-adduction-and-massacre-at-camp-ashraf>
- ⁷³ "Iraqi leader denies holding 7 Iranian dissidents," Associated Press, 20 September 2013
- ⁷⁴ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14740-iran-regime-maliki-plot-to-deceive-us-un-on-seven-camp-ashraf-hostages>
- ⁷⁵ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14753-iraq-camp-ashraf-hostages-are-held-in-prison-run-by-maliki-s-son>
- ⁷⁶ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/15598-an-iraqi-official-acknowledges-killing-of-one-of-the-hostages-and-their-presence-in-iraq>
- ⁷⁷ "Iran TV confirms death of opposition members in Iraq camp," BBC Worldwide Monitoring, 1 September 2013
- ⁷⁸ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14808-iraq-maliki-continuously-relocates-camp-ashraf-hostages-to-clear-traces-quds-force-agent-interrogate-them>
- ⁷⁹ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/camp-ashraf-massacre-sept-2013/14609-unhcr-calls-for-action-for-safety-of-seven-camp-ashraf-hostages>
- ⁸⁰ <http://www.dailystar.com.lb/News/Middle-East/2013/Sep-23/232255-eus-ashton-fears-for-safety-of-iran-dissidents.ashx#axzz30gEae9LR>
- ⁸¹ <http://amnesty.org/en/library/asset/MDE14/021/2013/en/c6bcb85c-f349-4161-9362-81691e3158d3/mde140212013en.html>
- ⁸² http://www.europarl.europa.eu/meetdocs/2009_2014/documents/d-iq/dv/d-iq20111005_02_/d-iq20111005_02_en.pdf
- ⁸³ http://www.usccar.org/legalopinions/Sassoli_Wills_Dec2008_US_Obligation_toProtect_PMOI.pdf
- ⁸⁴ Rajabi, Esmaeil. Interview with Curtis Sinclair. Electronic communication. January 9, 2014.
- ⁸⁵ <http://english.alarabiya.net/en/News/middle-east/2013/09/01/Blasts-reported-at-Iran-exile-camp-in-Iraq-.html>
- ⁸⁶ <http://p.washingtontimes.com/news/2013/sep/1/least-47-iranian-exiles-killed-iraqs-camp-ashraf/?page=all>
- ⁸⁷ <http://p.washingtontimes.com/news/2013/sep/1/least-47-iranian-exiles-killed-iraqs-camp-ashraf/?page=all>
- ⁸⁸ <https://www.un.org/apps/news//story.asp?NewsID=45748&Cr=Iraq&Cr1=>
- ⁸⁹ <http://unami.unmissions.org/Default.aspx?tabid=2790&ctl=Details&mid=5079&ItemID=1884772&language=en-US>
- ⁹⁰ <https://www.un.org/apps/news//story.asp?NewsID=45761&Cr=iraq&Cr1=>
- ⁹¹ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncri-statements/ashraf-liberty/14808-iraq-maliki-continuously-relocates-camp-ashraf-hostages-to-clear-traces-quds-force-agent-interrogate-them>
- ⁹² <http://www.unhcr.org/528b72259.html>
- ⁹³ <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=14078&>

Report on the September 1st Massacre at Camp Ashraf

-
- ⁹⁴ <http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2013/09/213696.htm>
- ⁹⁵ <http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2013/09/213919.htm>
- ⁹⁶ <http://news.yahoo.com/lawmakers-urge-u-save-7-camp-ashraf-hostages-160700833.html>
- ⁹⁷ <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/foreign-office-minister-condemns-violence-at-camp-ashraf-iraq>
- ⁹⁸ <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/alistair-burt-welcomes-peaceful-transfer-of-camp-ashraf-residents>
- ⁹⁹ <http://thediplomat.com/2013/11/iraq-must-free-7-camp-ashraf-hostages/>
- ¹⁰⁰ http://www.consilium.europa.eu/uedocs/cms_data/docs/pressdata/EN/foraff/138650.pdf
- ¹⁰¹ <http://www.amnesty.org/en/news/iraq-camp-ashraf-2013-09-02>
- ¹⁰² *Amnesty International, 'Urgent Action: Seven Iranian abducted from Camp Ashraf', September 11th 2013*
- ¹⁰³ <http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/MDE14/016/2013/en/072e3dd3-1a61-49bf-9c67-fc533b08705c/mde140162013en.html>
- ¹⁰⁴ <http://www.struanstevenson.com/news-and-views/news-releases/camp-ashraf-massacre-video>
- ¹⁰⁵ <http://ecrgroup.eu/news/the-west-must-step-in-to-stop-further-refugee-massacres-in-iraq/>
- ¹⁰⁶ <http://www.iran-interlink.org/?mod=view&id=7268>
- ¹⁰⁷ <http://news.nationalpost.com/2011/12/15/iraq-will-sent-peace-delegation-to-syria-nouri-al-maliki-says/>
- ¹⁰⁸ <http://edition.presstv.ir/detail/83411.html>
- ¹⁰⁹ www.mojahedin.org/linksen/536
- ¹¹⁰ <http://www.nejatngo.org/en/post.aspx?id=4093#.U1bNpKLD9ul>
- ¹¹¹ <http://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/round-the-clock-protest-at-state-department-to-demand-swift-decision-to-delist-mek-and-good-faith-action-to-resolve-the-humanitarian-crisis-at-camp-ashraf-126601053.html>
- ¹¹² <http://www.alsumaria.tv/news/42642/maliki-names-iraq-acting-national-security>
- ¹¹³ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/news/ashraf-liberty/11713-400-iran-exiles-reluctantly-move-to-new-iraq-home>
- http://www.qatar-tribune.com/data/20120219/content.asp?section=gulf1_2
- ¹¹⁴ <http://www.shafaaq.com/en/politics/8267-spanish-judiciary-opens-an-investigation-with-the-iraqi-national-security-adviser-.html>
- ¹¹⁵ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncr-statements/president-elect/15530-following-order-by-spanish-court-against-maliki-s-security-advisor-for-massacre-and-abductions-in-camp-ashraf>
- ¹¹⁶ <http://iran-interlink.org/wordpress/?p=2348>
- ¹¹⁷ <http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?type=MOTION&reference=B6-2009-0251&language=EN>
- ¹¹⁸ www.mojahedin.org/linksen/536
- ¹¹⁹ <http://www.alarabiya.net/articles/2009/01/23/64861.html>
- ¹²⁰ http://www.ashraf-news.com/news_view_1858.html
- ¹²¹ <http://www.trial-ch.org/en/resources/trial-watch/trial-watch/profiles/profile/1064/action/show/controller/Profile/tab/legal-procedure.html>
- ¹²² <http://www.trial-ch.org/en/resources/trial-watch/trial-watch/profiles/profile/1064/action/show/controller/Profile/tab/legal-procedure.html>
- ¹²³ <http://www.nejatngo.org/en/post.aspx?id=4563#.Ut5KlrvFK2w>
- ¹²⁴ <http://www.trial-ch.org/en/resources/trial-watch/trial-watch/profiles/profile/1064/action/show/controller/Profile/tab/legal-procedure.html>
- ¹²⁵ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/news/ashraf-liberty/9191-upon-instructions-of-iranian-regime-maliki-implements-new-suppressive-measures-against-ashraf-residents>
- ¹²⁶ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/news/ashraf-liberty/11872-injuring-of-29-ashraf-residents-due-to-the-iraqi-forces-attack-while-loading-fourth-groups-belongings-for-transfer-to-liberty>
- ¹²⁷ <http://www.ncr-iran.org/en/ncr-statements/ashraf-liberty/8995-iraqi-forces-set-up-a-new-post-in-camp-ashraf>